

ROYAL GOVERNMENT OF CAMBODIA MINISTRY OF INTERIOR

Livelihood Enhancement and Association of the Poor Project ("LEAP")

Credit No. 5960 - KH

Management Letter for the Year ended 31 December 2019



KPMG Cambodia Ltd 4th Floor, Delano Center No. 144, Street 169, Sangkat Veal Vong Khan 7 Makara, Phnom Penh Kingdom of Cambodia +855 23 216 899 | kpmg.com.kh

H.E. Prak SamOeun Project Director Ministry of Interior Norodom Blvd, Tonle Bassac Khan Chamkarmon, Phnom Penh Kingdom of Cambodia

Our ref NH/SCT/YLD/TAI/mkp

Contact: Yim Lundy

Tel: +855(23) 216 899 Ext: 7334

H/P: +855(89) 609 408

Email: <u>lundyyim@kpmg.com.kh</u>

30 June 2020

Your Excellency,

Management Letter - Audit for the ended 31 December 2019

We have audited, in accordance with Cambodian International Standards on Auditing, the financial statements of the Livelihood Enhancement and Association of the Poor Project ("the Project"), under Financing Agreement No. 5960 – KH funded by the International Development Association ("IDA" or "Development Partner") and the Royal Government of Cambodia represented by the Ministry of Economy and Finance, and executed by the Ministry of Interior for the year ended 31 December 2019, and have issued our report thereon 30 June 2020. An audit involves performing procedures to obtain audit evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the financial statements. The procedures selected depend on our judgment, including the assessment of the risks of material misstatements of the financial statements, whether due to fraud or error. In making those risk assessments, we considered internal control relevant to the Project's preparation of the financial statements in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the Project's internal control. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion on the effectiveness of the Project's internal control.

The maintenance of adequate control designed to fulfill control objectives is the responsibility of management. Because of inherent limitations in internal control, errors or fraud may nevertheless occur and not be detected. Also, controls found to be functioning at a point in time may later be found deficient because of the performance of those responsible for applying them, and there can be no assurance that controls currently in existence will prove to be adequate in the future as changes take place in the Project.



During our audit we noted certain matters involving internal control and other operational matters that are presented for your consideration. These comments and recommendations, all of which have been discussed with the appropriate members of management, are intended to improve internal control or result in other operating efficiencies and are summarised in the enclosed report.

Our audit procedures are designed primarily to enable us to form an opinion on the financial statements, and therefore may not bring to light all weaknesses in policies or procedures that may exist. We aim, however, to use our knowledge of the Project gained during our work to make comments and suggestions that we hope will be useful to you.

Our findings are grouped into the following audit areas:

- 1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls;
- 2. Procurement of goods, services and civil works
- Assets/Inventory management;
- 4. Cash management; and
- 5. Compliance with the key covenants of the financing agreements and local regulations.

The Project's written response to our comments and recommendations has not been subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of the financial statements and, accordingly, we express no opinion on it.

This communication is intended solely for the information and use of the Ministry of Economy and Finance, the IDA and the Project's management.

Yours faithfully,

For KPMG Cambodia Ltd

Nge Huy

Partner



Ministry of Interior Livelihood Enhancement and Association of the Poor

Credit No. 5960 - KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

Contents

		Page
I.	Project Coordination Office ("PCO")	
1.	Financial management including record keeping systems and controls	
1.1	Improve control over advance liquidation	1
1.2	Improve control over accounting record	3
2.	Procurement of goods, services, and civil works	
2.1	Set more realistic budget	4
3.	Assets/Inventory management – No finding	
4.	Cash management – No finding	
5.	Compliance with the key covenant of the financing agreement and local regulation – No finding	
Status	of previous period's recommendations	6



Ministry of Interior Livelihood Enhancement and Association of the Poor

Credit No. 5960 - KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

Contents

Page	8
------	---

- II. Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries ("MAFF")
- 1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls No finding
- 2. Procurement of goods, services, and civil works No finding
- 3. Assets/Inventory management No finding
- 4. Cash management No finding
- 5. Compliance with the key covenant of the financing agreement and local regulation No finding

Status of previous period's recommendations

10



Ministry of Interior Livelihood Enhancement and Association of the Poor

Credit No. 5960 – KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

Contents

		Page
III.	Siem Reap Province ("SRP")	
1.	Financial management including record keeping systems and controls	
1.1	Improve control over advance liquidation	11
2.	Procurement of goods, services, and civil works - No finding	
3.	Assets/Inventory management – No finding	
4.	Cash management – No finding	
5.	Compliance with the key covenant of the financing agreement and local regulation – No finding	
Status	of previous period's recommendations	13



Ministry of Interior Livelihood Enhancement and Association of the Poor

Credit No. 5960 - KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

Contents

		Page
IV.	Phnom Penh City Hall ("PPCH")	
1.	Financial management including record keeping systems and controls	
1.1	Improve control over accounting record	14
2.	Procurement of goods, services, and civil works - No finding	
3.	Assets/Inventory management – No finding	
4.	Cash management – No finding	
5.	Compliance with the key covenant of the financing agreement and local regulation – No finding	
Status	of previous period's recommendations	16



Credit No. 5960 – KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

- I. Project Coordination Office ("PCO")
- 1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls
- 1.1 Improve control over advance liquidation

Observation

In accordance with the Financial Management Manual issued by the Ministry of Economy and Finance, Article 14 and the Project's Supplementary Financial Management Manual Part I Section 8 state that "Cash advance" must be liquidated with full document of expenses incurred within 10 working days after the completion of the activities. However, we noted that the following advances were not cleared within the stipulated period. For instance:

Reference No.	Description	Completion date	Clearance date	Overdue days
DV/PCO/201 9/034	Ma Nirith - Liquid adv for 4th Bank's ISM to SRP from 27 Jan - 1 Feb 19	1-Feb-19	9-Apr-19	47 days
DV/PCO/20 19/020	Ma Nirith - Cash adv for M&E orientation to IAs 13 - 15 Feb 19	15-Feb-19	12-Mar-19	17 days

Similar issue was also raised following the previous period's audit.

Implication

The absence of timely liquidation of advances may affect the effectiveness of Project's monitoring and reporting. Moreover, advances may be subjected to risk of misappropriation if they are not closely monitored.



Credit No. 3900 – Ni 1

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls (continued)

1.1 Improve control over advance liquidation (continued)

Recommendation

Cash advances should be liquidated on a timely basis as required by the Financial Management Manual. Long outstanding advances should be promptly followed up.

Management's response 2018

We agree to this finding and will improve the control over the cash advance and liquidation on a timely manner. The Project has developed the Supplementary Financial Management Manual in which the World Bank provided the "No Objection" on 15 January 2019 and the three-day dissemination workshop has been conducted from 26 to 28 February 2019 on the financial management policies and procedures to all project staff and consultants to be aware and adhere to.

Management's response 2019

We agree with the finding and will continue to improve the control over the advance liquidation as well as building the capacity of the project staff in order to be in compliance with the project policies.



Management letter

For the year ended 31 December 2019

1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls (continued)

1.2 Improve control over accounting record

Observations

(i) There was an inconsistency between the reference number recorded in the voucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For example:

No.	Reference per GL	Reference per voucher	Amount US\$
1	DV/PCO/2019/018	DV/PCO/2019/118	164

(ii) There was an inconsistency between the transaction date recorded in the payment voucher and that recorded in the GL. For example:

No.	Reference	Date per GL	Date per vouchers	Amount US\$
1	DV/PCO/2019/032	4-Mar-2019	11-Mar-2019	10,000

This issue (i) was also raised following the previous period's audit.

Implication

Without consistent reference number and date in the GL, it will be difficult to control the completeness and accuracy of transactions posted to the general ledger, and leading to less reliable financial statements. It may be time consuming for the subsequent verification.

Recommendation

The Project should strengthen controls over the documentation of its vouchers and transactions recorded in the general ledger in order to reduce errors as well as to improve the efficiency of the accounting works.

Management's response 2018

We agree with the finding and will improve the control over the vouchers and records of the transactions in GL.

Management's response 2019

We agree with the finding and will strengthen the control over the vouchers and records of the transactions in the accounting system.



Credit No. 3900 – N. I

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

2. Procurement of goods, services, and civil works

2.1 Set more realistic budget

Observation

The estimated budgets of the Project expenditure are not comparable to the actual expenditure in all categories. There were significant variances as follows:

No.	Description	Budget US\$	Actual US\$	Variance %
1	Goods	208,468	212,237	2%
2	Works	1,283,400	564,085	-56%
3	Consultants' services	892,545	618,785	-31%
4	Training and Workshops	1,025,542	335,090	-67%
5	Incremental Operating costs	681,657	431,267	-37%
6	Community Grants	721,200	35,000	-96%

This issue was also raised following the previous period's audit.

Implication

If the budget is to be used as an effective control, it is important that it is prepared on the basis of realistic assumption. Otherwise, it will be much harder for management to utilise the budget as guidelines for expenditure and to monitor whether funds are properly spent.

Recommendation

The Project management should use their best estimates and experience to set a more realistic budget based on work plans and expected payments. The budget should be reviewed regularly and revised if needed.

Management's response 2018

We agree with this finding and will make the best estimate and regularly monitor the status implementation of the plan. In 2018, the project has not enough the human resources particularly, the technical consultants at PCO, PPCH and SRP caused the slow process of the development of the annual workplan and budget. As a result, the implementation was behind the target.



Credit No. 5960 – KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

2. Procurement of goods, services, and civil works (continued)

2.1 Set more realistic budget (continued)

Management's response 2019

We agree with the finding. The project was able to spend only 46% of the budget. The community infrastructure projects, both PPCH and SRP, could not be completed due to the rainy season, and some projects were not been able to be bided and signed the contract until the end of the year. The consultants' services and training were not achieved as plan due to the unsuccessful procurement of the Human Resources Development Specialist Providers for Both SRP and PPCH, to assist on disseminate, mobilize and enrolment of the training candidates to the vocational training. On the other hand, the seed grants could not been released to the SHGs due to the capacity of the established SHGs, and delayed process of the Household Investment Plan (HIP) and Micro Investment Plan of SHGs.



Status for the previous period's recommendations

).	Observations					Recommendations	Status of implementation
	Improve control over advance liquidation				control over advance liquidation		
	Ministry of E must be liq working day	ce with the Financial Mar Economy and Finance, Artic uidated with full document is after the completion of the advances were not cleare	cle 14 states of expense activities. Ho	that "Cash es incurred owever, we	advance" within 10 noted that	basis as required by the Financial Management Manual. Long outstanding advances should be promptly followed up.	•
	instance:						
	Reference No.	Description	Completion date	Clearance date	Overdue days		
	Reference	Description Prak Vanarouen -Adv. mission to SRP for meeting on project challenges 16-19 May 18	_				



Status for the previous period's recommendations (continued)

No.			Observations		Recommendations	Status of implementation
2.	Improve control over accounting record					
		uchers and those red	petween the reference nu corded in the General L		The Project should strengthen controls over the documentation of its vouchers and transactions recorded in the general ledger in order to reduce errors as well as to improve the efficiency of the	Partially implemented. Refer to item 1.2(i).
	No.	Per GL reference	Per vouchers reference	Amount US\$	accounting works.	
	1	CRV-18/PCO-	CRV-18/PCO-005	107,591.89		
	2	JV/18/PCO/005	JV/18/PCO/004	6,901.24		
3.	Update	e the contract register	r			
			it, we noted that there we he consultant agreement.		We recommended that the Project should update register and ensure all information in the	Implemented.
	Co	onsultant Name	Per contract register US\$	Per agreement US\$	consultant agreement are be up to date.	
		Teng Ratana	82,800	99,981		
		hy Ponlork	72,000	86,940		
	Mr. H	ong Sophea	140,000	169,050		



Status for the previous period's recommendations (continued)

No.		Observations				Recommendations	Status of implementation
4.	Prepare minutes of management meetings						
		ngs are usually conducted be ffs. However, no minutes were		•	•	Minutes of management meetings should be prepared and maintained. Any outstanding matters should be checked at future meetings until resolved.	Implemented.
5.	Set m	ore realistic budget					
0.	The e	estimated budgets of the Projectual expenditure in all categori				The Project management should use their best estimates and experience to set a more realistic budget based on work plans and expected payments. The budget should be reviewed	Not implemented. Refer to item 2.1.
0.	The e	estimated budgets of the Projectual expenditure in all categori				estimates and experience to set a more realistic budget based on work plans and expected	•
.	The e	estimated budgets of the Projectual expenditure in all categories:	es. There we	re significant Actual	variances as Variance	estimates and experience to set a more realistic budget based on work plans and expected payments. The budget should be reviewed	•
J.	The entre action follows No.	estimated budgets of the Projectual expenditure in all categories: Description	Budget US\$	Actual US\$	variances as Variance %	estimates and experience to set a more realistic budget based on work plans and expected payments. The budget should be reviewed	•
J.	The entre action following No.	estimated budgets of the Projectual expenditure in all categories: Description Goods	Budget US\$ 875,430	Actual US\$	variances as Variance % -37%	estimates and experience to set a more realistic budget based on work plans and expected payments. The budget should be reviewed	•



Credit No. 5960 – KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

Status for the previous period's recommendations (continued)

KPMG

No.	Observations	Recommendations	Status of implementation
6.	Improve control over petty cash safeguard		
	During our audit there is no segregation of duties between the person who hold the keys and the passwords of the safe for the petty cash.	The Project should ensure the segregation of duties between handling cash funds and recording cash related transactions. Such compensating controls as regular and surprise cash counts and formal bank reconciliations should be put in place should there be a shortage of staff.	Implemented.



II. Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries ("MAFF")

Status for the previous period's recommendations

No.	Observations	Recommendations	Status of implementation
1.	Improve control over petty cash safeguard During our audit there is no segregation of duties between the person who hold the keys and the passwords of the safe for the petty cash.	The Project should ensure the segregation of duties between handling cash funds and recording cash related transactions. Such compensating controls as regular and surprise cash counts and formal bank reconciliations should be put in place should there be a shortage of staff.	Implemented.



III. Siem Reap Province ("SRP")

1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls

1.1 Improve control over advance liquidation

Observation

In accordance with the Financial Management Manual issued by the Ministry of Economy and Finance, Article 14 and the Project's Supplementary Financial Management Manual Part I Section 8 state that "Cash advance" must be liquidated with full document of expenses incurred within 10 working days after the completion of the activities. However, we noted that the following advances were not cleared within the stipulated period. For instance:

Reference No.	Description	Completion date	Clearance date	Overdue days
DV/SRP/201 9/172	KUOCH VARY THLA - Cash Advance for SHGs Forming Meeting of 85 villages from 12-Sep to 2-Oct-19	2-Oct-19	22-Oct-19	14 days
DV/SRP/201 9/109	LUM SOKHAK, Admin Assistant - Cash Advance for Orientation Workshop of PIM & COM at SRA from 4-Jul to 5-Jul-19	5-Jul-19	22-Jul-19	13 days
DV/SRP/201 9/051	SAMOUL SOKNA, Infra Technical - Cash Advance for Infra Verification for 2019 from 11-Mar to 20-Mar-19	21-Mar-19	25-Apr-19	23 Days
DV/SRP/201 9/215	PICH SOMRECH, HR Officer - Cash Advance for Skill Orientation workshop for Choosing Candidates training from 18-Nov to 12-Dec-19	12-Dec-19	23-Jan-20	17 Days
DV/SRP/201 9/181	SAMOUL SOKNA, Infra Technical - Cash Advance for Project Prioritization of 47 Commune from 30-Sep to 4-Oct-19	4-Oct-19	1-Nov-19	17 Days



Credit No. 5960 – KH

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls (continued)

1.1 Improve control over advance liquidation (continued)

Implication

The absence of timely liquidation of advances may affect the effectiveness of Project's monitoring and reporting. Moreover, advances may be subjected to risk of misappropriation if they are not closely monitored.

Recommendation

Cash advances should be liquidated on a timely basis as required by the Financial Management Manual. Long outstanding advances should be promptly followed up.

Management's response

We agree to the finding and strengthen the implementation of the related project policies as well as build the awareness of the project policies to the project staff.



Status for the previous period's recommendations

No.	Observations				Recommendations	Status of implementation
1.	. Improve control over accounting record There was an inconsistency between the transaction date recorded in the payment voucher and those recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For examples:				recorded in the general ledger in order to reduce	·
	Reference	Description	Per GL date	Per voucher date	errors as well as to improve the efficiency of the accounting works.	
	JV-2018- LEAP-SRP- 007	Clear Cash Advance-Snacks, Materials for TOT Saving & Record to SMT	14 Nov 18	20 Nov 18		



- IV. Phnom Penh City Hall ("PPCH")
- 1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls
- 1.1 Improve control over accounting record

Observations

(i) There were an inconsistencies between the reference numbers recorded in the vouchers and those recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For examples:

No.	References per GL	References per vouchers	Amount US\$
1	JV/PPCH/2019/012	JV/PPCH/2019/012a	2,130
2	JV/PPCH/2019/012a	JV/PPCH/2019/012	1,160
3	JV/PPCH/2019/014	JV/PPCH/2019/015	7,662

(ii) There was an inconsistency between the transaction date recorded in the payment voucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For example:

No.	Reference	Date per GL	Date per vouchers	Amount US\$
1	JV/PPCH/2019/021	17-Dec-19	31-Dec-19	3,096

(iii) The expenditure amount per supporting document was erased or cross out by pen and re-wrote in a new amount without any acknowledgement from the authorised person. For example:

No.	Reference	Description	Amount US\$
1	DV/PCO/2019/018	CHEM DALIN-PHNOM PENH BEAUTY S - 50% payment for vocational training 8 students-studying at Phnom Penh Beauty School	1,750



Credit No. 3900 – Ni

Management letter For the year ended 31 December 2019

1. Financial management including record keeping systems and controls (continued)

1.1 Improve control over accounting record (continued)

Implications

- (i)&(ii) Without consistent reference number and date in the GL, it will be difficult to control the completeness and accuracy of transactions posted to the general ledger, leading to less reliable financial statements. It may be time consuming for the subsequent verification.
- (iii) In the absence of any initial or evidence of verification on any change made on the supporting document from authorised person, the management will find it difficult to identify who has made the change; consequently, unauthorised amount might be paid and posted into the accounting system.

Recommendations

- (i)&(ii) The Project should strengthen controls over the documentation of its vouchers and transactions recorded in the general ledger in order to reduce errors as well as to improve the efficiency of the accounting works.
- (iii) The authorised person should initial on the supporting documents for any change made to evidence their acknowledgement on such change.

Management's responses

- (i)&(ii) We agree to the finding and strengthen the control over the documents and vouchers and the transactions recorded int the accounting system.
- (iii) We agree to the finding and strengthen the control over the supporting documents for any changes to be acknowledged by the authorized person.





Status for the previous period's recommendations

Observations			Recommendations	Status of implementation		
Improve control over advance liquidation					Cash advances should be liquidated on a timely basis as required by the Financial Management	
There was an inconsistency in the transaction date recorded in the payment voucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For examples:						
Reference No.	Description	Completion date	Clearance date	Overdue days	Manual. Long outstanding advances should be promptly followed up.	
JV-18-LEAP- PPCH-003	•		24-Aug-18	12 days		
	There was an voucher and to Reference No. JV-18-LEAP-	Improve control over advance liquida There was an inconsistency in the trans voucher and that recorded in the General Reference No. Description JV-18-LEAP- PPCH-003 Liquid adv. Enumerator wages for community	Improve control over advance liquidation There was an inconsistency in the transaction date revoucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL Reference No. Description date JV-18-LEAP- Liquid adv. Enumerator PPCH-003 wages for community Reference No. Description date	Improve control over advance liquidation There was an inconsistency in the transaction date recorded in the voucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For example, and the control of the Completion of the Completio	Improve control over advance liquidation There was an inconsistency in the transaction date recorded in the payment voucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For examples: Reference No. Description Clearance date date days JV-18-LEAP- Liquid adv. Enumerator PPCH-003 Wages for community Reference Adv. Enumerator Wages for community	Improve control over advance liquidation There was an inconsistency in the transaction date recorded in the payment voucher and that recorded in the General Ledger ("GL"). For examples: Reference No. Description Clearance date Description Description Description Description Description Description Description Descr